

INITIATIVES FOR WHAT WORKS FOR WOMEN'S ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT ( IWWWEE)

# SOCIAL PROTECTION FOR WOMEN'S ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT

# Lessons from Kazi Mtaani



**FEBRUARY 2022** 





# Contents

Paulo

ABOUT THE POLICY BRIEF	4
1.0 INTRODUCTION	4
2.0 METHODOLOGY AND APPROACH	5
3.0 KEY FINDINGS	6
4.0 KEY CHALLENGES OF THE KAZI MTAANI PROGRAM	9
5.0 KEY SUCCESSES OF THE KAZI MTAANI PROGRAM	9
6.0 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR DECISION MAKERS	10





### POLICY BRIEF SOCIAL PROTECTION FOR WOMEN'S ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT: LESSONS FROM KAZI MTAANI

### **ABOUT THE POLICY BRIEF**

This Policy Brief is the result of research conducted by the Women's Economic Empowerment Hub, African Women Studies Center, University of Nairobi. The research involved desk research, a review of best practices for social protection program design and collection of both qualitative and quantitative data in four counties where Kazi Mtaani was implemented, *namely*: Nairobi, Kiambu, Nakuru and Kitui. The objective of the research was to evaluate the lessons that can be learnt from the Kenya Government's Economic Stimulus Packages on social protection safety nets for future disaster preparedness for WEE using the example of Kazi Mtaani. The outcomes of the research were presented during debrief workshops in the counties and the key findings distilled through this policy brief.

### **1.0 INTRODUCTION**

The COVID-19 pandemic significantly affected men and women particularly business owners and women in the informal sector. In response to this, the government enacted numerous rules, regulations and policies. These measures contributed to the vulnerabilities of women workers in the informal sector. The measures resulted in business closures, increased costs etc. The government rolled out Monetary policies e. g. Credit guarantee scheme, the eight-point economic stimulus package of May 31, 2001, the Kazi Mtaani Program, Fiscal policies e.g. Reduction of taxes for businesses. Social Protection is critical in ensuring women's economic empowerment. This research aimed at using the example of Kazi Mtaani to evaluate the lessons that can be learnt from the Kenya Government's Economic Stimulus

Packages on social protection safety nets for future disaster preparedness for WEE. Kazi Mtaani is a national initiative that was launched in April 2020 to cushion the most vulnerable and able-bodied youth in informal settlements from the effects of the Covid 19 pandemic. The Program which started with a budget of Kshs 10 billion has employed 283,210 youths in informal settlements across the 47 counties in Kenya The program targets youth above 18 years to 35 years who are unemployed and has cushioned them economically by paying them Sh455 and their supervisors Sh505 a day via M-Pesa for purposes of transparency and accountability. As the government moves towards rolling out the third phase, we hope that this Policy Brief will provide insights and recommendations that will shape the design of the program for greater sustainability and economic empowerment.

### 2.0 METHODOLOGY AND APPROACH

The study took place in Nakuru, Nairobi, Kiambu and Kitui Counties. These study sites were selected because the four selected Counties were among the first Counties where Kazi Mtaani programme and Inua Jamii programmes were piloted. To determine sample size for quantitative data, the study employed the Cochran formula to determine ideal sample i.e.  $n=z\alpha/22$  (p) (1-p)/c2 and adjusted for a small population.

 $z\alpha/2$  is the critical value for a given level of confidence ( $\alpha$ ); p is the proportion of occurrence in the population while c is the confidence interval/ precision. Using 90% confidence level, +or - 0.05 confidence interval and 50% as a % of occurence;

 $3.0 \qquad n = 1.6452(0.5)(0.5)/0.052 = 269$ 

Adjusting for small population n0= n/(1+(n-1)/N)=250

Therefore 250 participants were targeted from each County. However, the response rate was 994 out of which 180 were Inua Jamii beneficiaries. The sampling strategy was a stratified sampling to include the Kazi mtaani and Inua Jamii programmes target population. These participants were drawn from both formal and informal settlements, and they included both beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries of Kazi Mtaani and Inua Jamii programmes with specific target groups of youths, the elderlies, persons living with disabilities, orphans and vulnerable children who are the target group for Kazi Mtaani and Inua Jamii programs. A digitalized Survey questionnaire was administered by KNBS Enumerators. The data was cleaned and analyzed using SPSS for quantitative data analysis. On the other hand, the qualitative data was collected using FGD Guides and KII guides and a total of 19 FGDs and 77KIIs were conducted. The interviews were recorded, and the audios were transcribed. The data from the transcribed audios was then coded using NVivo and a report that was used to identify the recurring themes and the key issues.

#### **Beneficiaries by County**

Table 1 shows the distribution of Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries by County; 21.8% of the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries respondents were from Kiambu, 15.6% of them were from Kitui, 41.1% of them were from Nairobi while 21.5% of them were from Nakuru County.

### Table 1: Distribution of Kazi Mtaanibeneficiaries by County

County	N	%
Kiambu	60	21.8%
Kitui	43	15.6%
Nairobi	113	41.1%
Nakuru	59	21.5%
Total	275	100.0%

The COVID-19 pandemic significantly affected men and women particularly business owners and women in the informal sector. In response to this, the government enacted numerous rules, regulations and policies.





The participants were drawn from both formal and informal settlements, and they included both beneficiaries and non beneficiaries. The target group included the youths, the, persons living with disabilities, who are the target group for Kazi Mtaani program. A digitalized Survey questionnaire was administered by KNBS Enumerators. The quantitative data was cleaned and analyzed using SPSS. On the other hand, the qualitative data was collected using FGD Guides and KII guides. 16KIIs and 5 FGDs were conducted in Nakuru. 32KIIs and 5 FGDs were conducted in Kiambu. 12 KIIs and 4 FGDs were conducted in Kitui. 17 KIIs and 4FGDs were conducted in Nairobi. Data was coded using NVivo.

### **3.0 KEY FINDINGS**

### Source of information about Kazi Mtaani

Table 2 below shows where the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries learnt about the programme. The table shows that most of them learnt through pamphlet from the implementing institution (98.2%) followed by the social media (86.9%), advertisements / posters (80.7%) and the mainstream media. Only a few (40.4%) learnt it through the local authority.

Table 2: Source of information where theKazi Mtaani Beneficiaries learnt about theprogramme

Ν	%
221	80.4
222	80.7
157	57.1
111	40.4
177	64.4
239	86.9
270	98.2
	222 157 111 177 239

#### Whether the source of information was reliable

Table 3 below shows that 91.6% of the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries reported that the source of information about Kazi Mtaani was reliable.

### Table 3: Whether the source of information wasreliable

Do you think the source of information was reliable?	Ν	%
Yes	252	91.6%
No	23	8.4%
Total	275	100.0%

Existence of difficulties during application process

Table 4 below shows that only 21.8% of the Kazi Mtaani experienced problems during application process.

### Table 4: Whether the beneficiaries experiencedany difficulties during application process.

Did you experience any difficulties during application process?	Ν	%
Yes	59	21.8
No	216	78.2
Total	275	100.0

#### **Type of difficulties**

Those who reported to have had difficulties during application process were further asked the type of difficulties that they experienced. Their responses are presented in Table 4 below. Out of those who said they had difficulties, 88.1% of them said they had difficulties accessing the chiefs' office, 89.8% of them said they did not understand the registration process while 50.8% of them noted that the application/registration process took too long. Those who said they experienced other difficulties were asked to specify the difficulties experienced and some of them stated that the available slots were too few as compared to the applicants and thus they faced stiff competition. Others noted that favoritism prevailed and if not known by the chief, it was very difficult to get a chance.

Table 5: Difficulties experienced by the beneficiaries during application process.

What type of difficulties did you experience?	Ν	%
Access to the Chiefs office	52	88.1%
I did not understand the application/ registration process	53	89.8%
The application/ registration process took too long	30	50.8%
Other difficulties	38	64.4%

### able 6: Whether the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries were satisfied with selection criteria

Were you satisfied	Ν	%
with selection criteria		
Yes	237	86.2
No	38	13.8
Total	275	100.0

#### **Reception of payment from Kazi Mtaani**

99.3% of the beneficiaries reported that they had received payment for work done as shown on table 7 below. Those that had payment issues cited they had not received payment in full for work done.

#### Table 7: Reception of payment from Kazi Mtaani

Have you received payment from work done?	Ν	%
Yes	273	99.3
No	2	.7
Total	275	100.0

### Whether the program benefited the targeted group

97.5% of the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries responded in the affirmative that indeed that the program benefited targeted group whereas 2.5% observed it did not, pointing out that the programme as a whole benefitted only a small proportion of the target population. They also cited issues of ghost workers and nepotism in the recruitment process. Finally, those living with disabilities felt left out of the program since it was mainly manual labor focused especially those do not receive cash transfers from the government through the Inua Jamii program.

### Table 8: Whether the Kazi Mtaani beneficiarieswere satisfied with selection criteria

Were you satisfied with selection criteria	N	%
Yes	237	86.2
No	38	13.8
Total	275	100.0

How the Kazi Beneficiaries spent the proceeds they received

Most of the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries spent the proceeds on food and rent at 86.2% and 54.9%

respectively as shown on table 7 below.

### Table 9: how they spent the proceeds receivedfrom Kazi Mtaani program

Use of proceeds from	Ν	%
the program		
Food	237	86.2%
Medical expenses	39	14.2
Rent	151	54.9%
School fees		
	85	30.9%
Clothing	106	38.5%
Farming	17	6.2%

Whether the money was enough to cater for their needs.

Only 43.3% of the beneficiaries reported that the money they received from Kazi Mtaani was enough to cater for all their needs as shown on table 10 below.

Table 10: Whether the money was enough to cater for their needs.

Do you think the money	Ν	%
was enough to cater for		
all your needs?		
Yes	119	43.3
No	156	56.8
Total	275	100.0



those living with disabilities felt left out of the program since it was mainly manual labor focused especially those do not receive cash transfers from the government through the Inua Jamii program.

### 4.0 KEY CHALLENGES OF THE KAZI MTAANI PROGRAM:

- **Delayed Payments:** Delayed payments to the Kazi Mtaani beneficiaries.
- **Favoritism** in the recruitment process. In some areas, the youth have protested against favoritism in the Kazi Mtaani program. Accusations of nepotism and bribery in the hiring of youth.

"Let us avoid "mtu wetu" mentality and hold our leaders accountable for our future. We are letting ourselves down! We have a rich resourceful country but poor governance" – KII Participant Nairobi

- Protective Gear: The youth were not provided with proper tools and protective gear which exposed them to injuries and diseases.
- Lack of Transparency and Accountability: Many youths were being hired after committing to share their daily wages with chiefs.
- Equality of Opportunity: Strangers from other regions being employed thus limiting the job opportunities for the youth in the area that they are supposed to be employed.

"Disability is a club anyone can join. It is free for all so we should care for each other in the best way possible" – KII Participant Kiambu

- **Recruitment Process Challenges:** The recruitment process is not free and fair at all in some areas. Names being removed at the last minute after successful acceptance into the program.
- Few Job Opportunities: A large number of applications but fewer job opportunities.

"We just look for a solution that will be a long term not for a month or a week. So, we were requesting if those industries can be revived. We have like 5 industries in Nakuru County, all the companies that collapsed should be revived again to create employment for the youths" FGD Participant Nakuru

### 5.0 KEY SUCCESSES OF THE KAZI MTAANI PROGRAM

 Job Creation: Kazi Mtaani has provided jobs for many youths since a person has to be in the age bracket of 18-35 years to be recruited. What started out as a measure to deal with the pandemic turned out to play a much bigger role in so far as creating job opportunities and providing a model that can be replicated in order to deal with the massive unemployment problem in the country.

"According to me Kazi mtaani has helped me. I used to clean clothes for people but at least now I have a daycare am looking at young kids and that's where I got the capital. Kazi mtaani helped us to like a brother and a sister. As you see us here now, we are brothers and sisters. There is a day I got sick and the Kazi mtaani youths contributed to my hospital bills. I was subjected to a certain surgery and the Kazi mtaani people paid all the bills. They also needed people to donate blood and the Kazi mtaani people showed up. They wanted two pints. They had to donate three pints and they dint demand anything from me. They did it wholeheartedly, were it not for them I don't know what I would have done. Those people helped me. That is the much I can say about Kazi mtaani" Kazi Mtaani beneficiary Nakuru

 Environmental Conservation: The youth have collected and cleaned garbage in their neighborhood. Trees have been planted in the neighborhoods and drainages have been unclogged.

"Daktarii I can also say that Kazi mtaani has helped in terms of cleanliness. Before Kazi mtaani, some covid people were...{inaudible} but due to cleanliness, I have noticed that most of the diseases are not existing anymore since they have collected all the litter that was just lying anyhow and taken to the dumping site by the municipality car. People were also advised to look for a place where they will be putting their litter and that it will be collected after every week. There are minimal chances of malaria infection since there is no mosquito bleeding anymore since the environment is clean" FGD Participant Nakuru

- Youth Empowerment: Youths were able to meet their basic needs and help their families for example paying rent and buying food
- Reduction of Crime: Crime has been reduced in those neighborhoods. It has also kept the youth from drugs, alcohol and immorality.
- **Debt Reduction**: Safaricom PLC waived the recovery of Fuliza loans for the youths in the program that have been indebted.
- Cushioned Jobless Youth: Kazi Mtaani has cushioned jobless youths economically by paying them Sh455 and their supervisors Sh505 a day via M-Pesa for purposes of transparency and accountability.
- Entrepreneurship: Participants were able to freely withdraw their earnings once paid and some were able to start small businesses.

"We need to go back to the beginning, when we had industries that supported local industries not all these second hand things. Mitumba is like modern day slavery and Kenya is a dumping site! This will help us grow our local industries and economy"– KII Participant Rironi.



## 6.0 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR DECISION MAKERS

On the basis of the research, several recommendations for policy and decision makers have emerged from both the participants of Kazi Mtaani and key informants who were part of the program. These policy recommendations concern the different stages of the Kazi Mtaani Program Cycle.

### **PROGRAM DESIGN:**

- Equal Participation: The Kazi Mtaani Program should ensure inclusivity and equal participation in the program by all unemployed youths aged 18-35
- Non-Discrimination: The Kazi Mtaani Program should include persons with disabilities, gender, pregnancy status, women etc.
- Expand the Types and Nature of Work: The type of work should be expanded and diversified to ensure inclusivity of both men and women of different ages and abilities.
- Gender Needs: Kazi Mtaani program should take into account practical and strategic gender needs when designing the work and when deciding who does what and how to ensure that the program achieves its intended purpose and the youths are able to benefit in their different capacities and circumstances.
- The Program needs to provide holistic sets of services including livelihood trainings, productive asset transfers, consumption support, financial literacy, savings plans and health care.
- The program also needs to take into consideration how to make it sustainable in terms of the number of unemployed youths in this country and the budgetary implications that may arise as a result.

#### RECRUITMENT

- Transparency of the Selection Criteria: Kazi Mtaani Program should be transparent and open and ensure that the new online recruitment process is accessible to all. In order to ensure a fast roll out of the program, a pre-existing eligibility criteria needs to be clearly spelt out.
- Access to Information: Previously, advertisement was through media and offices, Kazi Mtaani should be both online and offline and should seek to reach as many constituents as possible through multiple media sources such as radio, whatsapp, church, mosque, chief barazas. The application needs to available in multiple forms: phone, chief's office so as to ensure maximum outreach.
- Selection Criteria: in shortlisting the beneficiaries it needs to be subjected to public participation. After the youth have applied, the same procedure used in public service should be followed and a final list published after shortlisting. The community should participate in this process.

#### **IMPLEMENTATION:**

- The government needs to digitize cash transfers as it will ensure greater digitization and openness
- Gender Disaggregated Data: The Program needs to provide gender disaggregated information on beneficiaries of social protection programs and monitor and evaluate the benefits of social protection measures by gender, age, other demographic characteristics.
- Building Partnerships: Kazi Mtaani should partner with organizations and other

stakeholders that can provide data and opportunities for the youth through this program including women's organizations, self-help groups and unions since they are already self-mobilizing and working towards economic empowerment.

"Women are more receptive and hungry to learn. Their adaptability is their strength". Therefore, organizations and the government should take advantage of this and find ways of empowering women to bring lasting change in our nation"– KII Participant Nakuru

- Adoption of a Social Protection Policy: The government should adopt social protection policies to be implemented by national and county governments.
- **Money Bill:** There should be a bill that caters specifically to Social protection of vulnerable youths without discrimination.
- Multisectoral Support: The government should ensure a comprehensive package of multisectoral support is provided to beneficiaries so as to set up gender responsive systems and capacities.

#### MONITORING, REPORTING AND EVALUATION:

 Complaints and feedback mechanisms need to be put in place so as to monitor information and address issues. Clear structures need to be put in place to ensure that issues are addressed promptly and effectively without any discrimination.

This report is the result of research conducted by the Women's Economic Empowerment Hub, African Women Studies Centre, University of Nairobi. The objective of the research was to evaluate the lessons that can be learnt from Kenya Government's Economic Stimulus packages on social <u>protection safety nets for future disaster preparedness for women's economic empowerment</u>.